

Written Testimony of
Michael B. Carroll, Secretary of Transportation
Pennsylvania Department of Transportation
Pennsylvania Automated Enforcement of Traffic Violations
Senate Transportation Committee
September 18, 2023

Chair Langerholc, Chair Flynn, and members of the Senate Transportation Committee: I would like to thank you for your interest and focus on Pennsylvania's Automated Work Zone Speed Enforcement Program. I would also like to present the following information on behalf of our Automated Work Zone Speed Enforcement Program partners, the Pennsylvania State Police and Pennsylvania Turnpike Commission, who have reviewed and concur with the written testimony provided to the Senate Transportation Committee.

The following testimony centers around SB 748; SB 851; HB 1284; and HB 1662, all of which propose adjustments to several Automated Enforcement sections within the Pennsylvania Vehicle Code, 75 Pa. C.S. § 3345.1 (Automated School Bus Side Arm Enforcement), 75 Pa. C.S. § 3369 (Automated Work Zone Speed Enforcement); 75 Pa. C.S. § 3370 (Automated Enforcement on Designated Highway); and a new section, 75 Pa. C.S. § 3371 (Automated Enforcement in designated School Zones). These programs ensure traffic safety laws are effectively administered to protect our most vulnerable road users (school students, construction workers, and pedestrians). Additionally, these types of programs are recommended by the National Transportation Safety Board [NTSB] (Safety Recommendations [H-17-32](#)), National Highway Traffic Safety Administration [NHTSA] ([A Highway Safety Countermeasure Guide for State Highway Offices, 10th Edition, 2020 – 2.1 Automated Enforcement](#)), and Federal Highway Administration [FHWA] ([Proven Safety Countermeasures – Safety Speed Cameras](#)). Pennsylvania's law and program administration have been highlighted and recommended as a model for other states by our federal partners effectively meeting the overall safety goals while ensuring that enforcing these critical highway safety laws is completed in a transparent and accountable manner. The attached summary of Pennsylvania's Automated Enforcement Programs provides vital points and details on each one of these programs.

Automated Work Zone Speed Enforcement (AWZSE) Program [75 Pa. C.S. § 3369]

This five-year pilot program is set to sunset in February 2024 unless legislative action is taken to eliminate or extend the program. The pilot program is jointly administered between PennDOT and the Pennsylvania Turnpike Commission, with critical support provided by the Pennsylvania State Police. An AWZSE violation occurs when a portable automated speed enforcement system identifies a vehicle traveling in excess of 11 MPH or greater over the posted work zone speed. This is only enforced in an active Work Zone when workers are performing activities adjacent to the roadway.

Each April 1, the [Annual Report on Automated Work Zone Speed Enforcement](#) is submitted to the Transportation Committee Chairs, per Vehicle Code Section 3369 requirements. The AWZSE program has demonstrated that it is meeting the purpose and goals of the program, and this can be seen in the attachment, specifically in the Performance Indicators row. Through the pilot program, PennDOT, the Pennsylvania Turnpike, and the Pennsylvania State Police have identified several suggested changes to Section 3369 on the last page of the [2023 Annual Report on Automated Work Zone Speed Enforcement](#). Generally, PennDOT supported legislation that addresses the suggested changes identified in this report and removes the expiration date of AWZSE as a pilot program. For example, SB 748, voted on by the Senate Transportation Committee earlier this year, removes the five-year pilot expiration of the program and addresses two of the suggested improvements. Other legislation that has passed through the House has kept the February 2024 expiration of the pilot program and added additional signage requirements. These new requirements are either unlikely to be helpful or need to be balanced with the overall safety of the work zone. For example, the placement of enforcement signs should not interfere with other work zone signs. PennDOT already has several program controls it utilizes to ensure that signs and active work activity are verified daily; these controls are documented and reviewed every one to two hours by an on-site AWZSE operator for the entire enforcement period.

Overall, PennDOT, the Pennsylvania Turnpike Commission and the Pennsylvania State Police strongly believes that allowing the law to sunset would be a significant step backward for progress in work zone safety throughout the Commonwealth. During the pilot period, this program has proven effective and transparent. Given successes outlined in the Annual Report, Pennsylvania is leading the way nationally for work zone speed safety cameras. This is illustrated by national recognition and how many other states have based their legislative and administrative framework on the framework developed here in the Commonwealth. The Department highly recommends removing the sunset date as soon as possible to ensure we do not have a lapse in the program's ability to provide enforcement through its existing contract as the 2024 highway construction season approaches.

Automated Speed Enforcement on Designated Highway [75 Pa. C.S. § 3370]

This five-year pilot program is set to sunset in December 2023 unless legislative action is taken to eliminate or extend the program, which is administered by the Philadelphia Parking Authority (PPA) with required approvals from the City of Philadelphia and PennDOT. Currently, there are only ten fixed locations in both directions along Roosevelt Boulevard (U.S.-1) in the City of Philadelphia between Ninth Street and the Bucks County line.

AWZSE, the Automated Speed Enforcement along Roosevelt Boulevard (U.S.-1) has demonstrated that it is meeting the purpose and goals of the program, which can be seen in the attachment, specifically in the Performance Indicators row. The Department concurs with the Pennsylvania State Transportation Advisory Committee's December 2022 study. It supports the recommendations to remove the expiration of the Roosevelt Boulevard (U.S.-1) corridor and continue to work on expanding Automated Speed Enforcement along designated corridors in an appropriate and justified manner.

PennDOT supports the language in SB 748 that extends the existing program, but additional corridors should be considered if there is a known crash or speeding problem or where previous mitigation strategies have been considered and unsuccessful. PennDOT also supports the language in the House bill that removes the sunset date and expands the program but is concerned about the criteria that will be utilized to select appropriate corridors. While the State Transportation Advisory Committee's independent study concluded that expansion should be considered, it identified further evaluation of corridors as a necessary step before expanding to additional corridors. Depending on the language in the law passed, PennDOT plans to develop appropriate criteria and policy for additional corridors with input from the Senate and House.

Pilot Program for Automated Speed Enforcement Systems in Designated School Zones **[Proposed new 75 Pa. C.S. § 3371]**

As mentioned earlier in our testimony, the Department supports Automated Enforcement Programs focused on ensuring traffic safety laws are effectively administered to protect our most vulnerable road users (school students, construction workers, and pedestrians). The new five-year pilot program proposed in the House's automated enforcement legislation would occur in active school zones with a 15 MPH speed limit. Automated enforcement systems will capture motorists going 11 MPH or more over the posted school speed limit. If the bill is considered, the Department will work with the appropriate stakeholders to ensure it has the same focus as the other automated enforcement programs.

Automated School Bus Side Arm Enforcement [75 Pa. C.S. § 3345.1]

This program is vital in improving safety for school children by providing schools with the ability to place Automated School Bus Side Arm Enforcement equipment on buses to enforce the requirement that motorists stop for a school bus with flashing red lights.

The existing law requires PennDOT to replace the temporary regulation with a permanent regulation by October 23, 2023. Unfortunately, in February 2023, the Pennsylvania State Police identified administrative concerns and requested a legislative change before they would continue with enforcement within jurisdictions. PennDOT supports the language in SB 851 that extends the sunset of the temporary regulation to October 23, 2024. This extension will allow additional time for the Department to finalize its draft permanent regulation and begin the regulatory process.

Conclusion

PennDOT, the Pennsylvania Turnpike Commission, the Pennsylvania State Police, City of Philadelphia, and our Industry Partners associated with these programs would like to see these programs continue to enforce already established traffic safety laws and change motorist behavior by reducing violations. It will always be the Department's intent to use these Automated Enforcement programs as a safety tool in our toolbox. The Department continues to stress that motorists should obey traffic safety laws so that no one is cited for a violation and, more importantly, everyone gets home safely each day.

I would like to again thank Chair Langerholc, Chair Flynn, and members of the Senate Transportation Committee for allowing the Department to provide this testimony. We hope you will consider taking legislative action to continue the existing programs and to implement proposed adjustments provided previously and within my testimony.

Pennsylvania's Automated Enforcement Programs (September 2023)

Program Element	Automated Red-Light Enforcement (ARLE) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 75 Pa.C.S. §3116 – 1st Class Cities (City of Philadelphia) 75 Pa.C.S. §3117 – Certain Municipalities (Abington Township) 	Automated Work Zone Speed Enforcement (AWZSE) 75 Pa.C.S. §3369 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> PennDOT – Interstates and FHWA NHS Routes Turnpike – Entire Network 	Automated Speed Enforcement (ASE) on Designated Highway 75 Pa.C.S. §3370 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roosevelt Blvd (U.S. 1) 	School Bus Side Signal Arm Enforcement Systems 75 Pa.C.S. §3345.1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 8 vendors with 13 systems approved 	Proposed School Speed Enforcement in Designated School Zones 75 Pa.C.S. §3371 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1st Class Cities (City of Philadelphia)
Legislation Sunset	07/15/2027 Act 101 of 2016	02/16/2024 (Current 5-yr Pilot Sunset) Act 86 of 2018	12/18/2023 (Current 5-yr. Pilot Sunset) Act 86 of 2018	No Sunset Date Act 159 of 2018	Proposed 5-year Pilot from Effective Date
Purpose/Goals:	Reduce Red Light Running	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reduce Speeds in Work Zones Improve Driver Behavior Save Worker and Traveler Lives Complement existing enforcement by PSP Promote Work Zone Safety 	Improve safety of vulnerable road users by enforcing existing posted speed limits along designated highways with known crash concerns.	Safety of children and ensuring conformance to existing laws regarding the overtaking of a school bus when it is picking up or dropping off people.	Safety of children by ensuring lowered speeds in designated School Zones.
Program Performance Indicators	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2017 State Transportation Advisory Committee Evaluation of Automated Red -Light Enforcement (June 2017) 2023 PPA Annual Report 	<p style="text-align: center;">2023 Annual Report for AWZSE (Mar. 2020 – Dec. 2022)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 8,868 Deployments Completed to Date <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3,482 deployments in 2022 Worker Protection <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 68% Barrier / 32% Channelizer % Excessively Speeding (11+ MPH over speed limit) nearly double in Barrier Zones 1,088,842 Violations Issued to Motorists <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 84% - \$0 First Violation (913,545) 11% - \$75 Second Violation (122,300) 5% - \$150 Third+ Violation (53,008) From Start of Program to End of 2022 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 38% Reduction in Speeding in AWZSE Zones (1+ MPH over the speed limit) 47% Reduction in Speeding in AWZSE Zones (11+ MPH over the speed limit) \$14.4 Million in Fine Revenue <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 76% Payment Rate As of end of 2022, PennDOT has not generated enough revenue to offset program costs (\$4 Million gap) Informal Hearings provide education to public <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Show how the program maintains an accurate and fair program, following the requirements in the legislation 7,100 hearing requests from start of program (0.65% of all issued violations) 55% of hearing requests have been on \$0 First Violations 80% of all contests have been found liable 	<p style="text-align: center;">2022 State Transportation Advisory Committee Evaluation of Pilot Program on Roosevelt Blvd. (Dec. 2022)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Before ASE (2019) versus After ASE (2021) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 36% Reduction in Total Crashes 11% Reduction in Fatalities and suspected serious injuries 17% Reduction in Total Speeding Replated Crashes 34% Reduction in Total Aggressive Driver Crashes Overall, total violations per month have decreased 96%, from 224,206 in June 2020 to 8,939 in February 2022. Average speeds went down at all but four locations, with many decreases being more than 10%. One location, the northbound express lanes at Red Lion Road, experienced a 37.8% reduction in average speeds Speed related crashes have dropped 17% along the Boulevard, whereas they have risen 12% across Philadelphia. In addition, total crashes with at least one aggressive driver decreased by 34% versus remaining virtually unchanged in Philadelphia 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> While vendors are not required to report to PennDOT the number of Automated School Bus Side Arm Systems, the Department is aware of twenty (20) school districts that began the current school year with 1300+ buses equipped with these systems. \$102,358.54 in revenue through August 2023. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Approximately, 4,084 violations based on \$25 revenue for each violation. \$250.54 donation provided. Temporary Regulation sunsets October 23, 2023, unless legislative action is taken. 	Proposed program with no performance targets yet. The goal would be to have similar results seen from the ARLE and Automated Speed Enforcement along Roosevelt Blvd. programs.
Legislative Concerns	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Currently no concerns 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Expiration of the Pilot Sunset Date (HB 1284) Requirement to add additional light on sign to increase sign conspicuity. (HB-1284 and HB 1662) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Expansion to all corridors through City of First Class with limited guidance on approval criteria (HB 1284) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Extension of the temporary regulation sunset date (October 23, 2023) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No concerns as proposed.
Required Signs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Posting of an appropriate sign in a conspicuous place before the area in which the automated red-light enforcement device is to be used 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2 warning signs prior to the enforcement device. 1 sign shall identify whether enforcement is active. – <i>Same sign identifying Active Enforcement was selected to simplify as be more transparent – FHWA PA Approved 11/21/2019.</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2 warning signs prior to the enforcement zone on each end (1 per direction). 2 warning signs placed in medians at 2-mile spacing through the corridor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No additional signs required. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At least two appropriate warning signs are conspicuously placed at the beginning and end of the designated school zone notifying the public that an

Pennsylvania's Automated Enforcement Programs (September 2023)

	notifying the public that an automated red-light enforcement device is in use.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1 sign at the end of automated work zone. – <i>End Roadwork Sign will be utilized</i> 1 sign at the enforcement vehicle – <i>Automated Enforcement Sign on Vehicle</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ordinance requires enforcement signs just prior to the violation All signs being utilized are MUTCD compliant with R10-18 and R-10-19aP 		automated speed enforcement device is in use.
Fine Amount	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Warning 1st 45 days ARLE installed at intersection \$100 fine with no points or insurance penalties each violation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Program had 60-day pre-enforcement period (Ended 03/04/20) 1st offense = \$0 fine, no points or insurance penalties 2nd offense = \$75, no points or insurance penalties 3rd and subsequent offenses = \$150, no points or insurance penalties 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Initial program 30-day warning period. Up to \$150-fine, no points or insurance penalties, but City established by ordinance an increased violation structure as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> \$100 – 11-19 mph over speed limit \$125 – 20 -29 mph over speed limit \$150 – 30+ mph over speed limit 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> \$300 Violation for each violation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> \$250 to School District Operations and Maintenance Costs \$25 to Police Department Review \$25 to the School Bus Safety Grant 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Up to \$150 fine per violation established by ordinance.
Defenses	<p>3 defenses are permitted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Vehicle was stolen Registered owner didn't own the vehicle during the time of offense Registered owner provides proof they were not operating the vehicle at the time of the violation. 	<p>3 defenses are permitted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Vehicle was stolen Registered owner didn't own the vehicle during the time of offense. Device calibration and/or testing issues 	<p>4 defenses are permitted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Vehicle was stolen Registered owner didn't own the vehicle during the time of offense. Device calibration and/or testing issues Registered owner provides proof they were not operating the vehicle at the time of the violation. 	<p>3 defenses are permitted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Vehicle was stolen Registered owner didn't own the vehicle during the time of offense. Registered owner provides proof they were not operating the vehicle at the time of the violation. 	<p>4 defenses are permitted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Vehicle was stolen Registered owner didn't own the vehicle during the time of offense. Device calibration and/or testing issues Registered owner provides proof they were not operating the vehicle at the time of the violation.
Agency and System Administrator Responsibilities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PennDOT – Approves Locations and part of ARLE Grant Selection Team City of Philadelphia Police – Reviews and Affirms violations City of Philadelphia Office of Transportation, Infrastructure, and Sustainability (oTIS) – Approves Locations and part of ARLE Grant Selection Team Philadelphia Parking Authority (PPA) – System Administrator and responsible for program reporting and management of automated enforcement vendor. Traffic Planning and Design – Provide Engineering assistance to PPA Conduent and Verra Mobility, Inc. – Red Light Camera Vendors 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PennDOT and PTC – Agency co-leads and administration of the program. Pennsylvania State Police (PSP) City of Philadelphia Police – Reviews and Affirms violations RK&K, LLP. – Consultant support with all program aspects for PennDOT and PTC. Verra Mobility, Inc. (previously Redflex Traffic Systems) – AWZSE enforcement vendor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PennDOT – Approves Locations and part of ARLE Grant Selection Team City of Philadelphia Police – Reviews and Affirms violations City of Philadelphia Office of Transportation, Infrastructure, and Sustainability (oTIS) – Approves Locations and part of ARLE Grant Selection Team Philadelphia Parking Authority (PPA) – System Administrator and responsible for program reporting and management of automated enforcement vendor. McMahon Associates, Inc. – Provide Engineering assistance to PPA Verra Mobility, Inc. – Speed Enforcement vendor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PennDOT – Provides Secretary approval of School Bus Side Arm Enforcement Equipment in conformance with minimum temporary regulation requirements and administrates the Grant Funding Program based on revenues or donations from the Program. School Districts and/or Bus Companies – Responsible for establishing contracts and ensuring conformance to Act 159 of 2018 and associated regulation requirements Enforcement Vendor – Provides services that vary based on requests by School Districts and/or Bus Companies should only be for services rendered and not per violation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Program Similar to ARLE and Automated Speed Enforcement (ASE) on Designated Highway
Program Specific Details	<p>Philadelphia Parking Authority (PPA) - https://philapark.org/red-light-cameras/</p> <p>Abington Township – https://www.abingtonpd.org/traffic-safety/red-light-cameras/</p> <p>PennDOT ARLE Program – https://www.dot.state.pa.us/public/Bureaus/BOMO/Portal/TSPortal/index.html</p>	<p>AWZSE Program - https://workzonecameras.penndot.gov/</p>	<p>Philadelphia Parking Authority (PPA) – https://philapark.org/speed-cameras/</p>	<p>PennDOT School Bus Safety – https://www.penndot.pa.gov/TravelInPA/Safety/TrafficSafetyAndDriverTopics/pages/school-bus-safety.aspx</p>	None